

CONFIRMED MINUTES - WORKFORCE COMMITTEE

Date:	Wednesday 24 April 2019	Time:	11:00 – 12.30
Venue:	Conference Room, Field House, BRI	Chair:	Selina Ullah, Non-Executive Director

Present:	Non-Executive Directors: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ms Selina Ullah, Non-Executive Director (SU) - Mr Jon Prashar, Non-Executive Director (JP) - Mr Amjad Pervez, Non-Executive Director (AM) Executive Directors: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ms Pat Campbell, Director of Human Resources (PC) - Ms Karen Dawber, Chief Nurse (KD) - Professor Alex Brown, Deputy Medical Director (AB), representing the Chief Medical Officer
In Attendance:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ms Lily Hurford, Assistant Director of HR \Head of Organisational Development (LH). W.4.19.9 - Ms Jo Hilton, Assistant Chief Nurse Quality and Workforce (JH). W.4.19.9 - Dr Ray Smith, Deputy Chief Medical Officer (RS). W.4.19.9 and W.4.19.10 - Ms Jacqui Maurice, Head of Governance (JM) – Minutes

No.	Agenda Item	ACTIONS
W.4.19.1	Apologies for Absence Dr Bryan Gill, Chief Medical Officer (BG)	
W.4.19.2	Declarations of Interest There were no interests were declared	
W.4.19.3	Unconfirmed Minutes of the meeting held on 27 March 2019 The following amends were requested: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Page 1. AP to be marked as present under the NED column. • Page 2. Matters escalated from other committees: section to be amended to reflect that “the Committee was being asked to note the article published in the Guardian newspaper on stress at work from the staff survey results. It was expected that the Workforce Plan will have a strong emphasis on Health and Well-being in the workplace”. • Page 3. Nursing Shifts. Section to be amended to reflect that the Matron was reassigned to provide additional support regarding leadership. • Page 4. Nurse Vacancies – amendment required to reflect that a recruitment event took place in A&E. • Page 4. Consultant positions – amend required to indicate 4 Infectious Disease Consultants would be leaving at the end of May 2019. • Page 4. EU Exit: deletion required with regard to tracking. • Page 4. NHS Staff Survey. Amend required to reflect that one of the key areas to be covered by the Trust was equality and diversity. Subject to these amends the minutes were accepted as a correct record.	Head of Corporate Governance
W.4.19.4	Matters Arising The Committee confirmed that the actions identified as completed on the action log were now closed. The following updates with regard to the open	

No.	Agenda Item	ACTIONS
	<p>actions were noted.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>W.1.19.17 Workforce Committee Annual Work Programme:</u> The Chief Digital and Information Officer would deliver a session on the Informatics five-year plan at the next Committee meeting. • <u>W.1.19.10 Workforce Report. EU Exit Preparation and Risk Assessment for Workforce:</u> An update would be provided to the Governors at their meeting scheduled for 18 April 2019. <u>Action concluded.</u> • <u>W.1.19.17 Development Sessions (best practice).</u> Additional sessions for the Programme to be confirmed. • <u>W.2.19.9 Workforce Report - Workforce Dashboard.</u> With regard to any changes to the dashboard; PC will be meeting with CF and her team at month end to discuss the dashboard in its entirety. PC reminded the Committee of the action from the Board of Directors with regard to the inclusion of a 'cultural indicator'. A tool for Trust's was available via NHS Quest to enable value for money, however there had been low take up by Trusts leading to insufficient benchmarking information - as such this option had not been pursued by BTHFT. The Committee was asked to note that PC and the Chief Digital and Information Officer were continuing to review other options including the development of a real time app that could be used by any staff member. 	
W.4.19.4.1	<p>Matters Arising from the Board of Directors</p> <p>SU advised of an action for all Board Committees from the open Board meeting held 7 March 2019 which was to "ensure that the Board Committees' challenge and are assured of the content of all component sections of the Board Assurance Framework". SU reminded the Committee of the discussions held at the previous two meetings culminating in the change to the risk appetite from 'cautious' to 'seeking'. The Committee agreed that it had concluded this action.</p>	
W.4.19.4.2	<p>Matters Escalated from the Sub Committee</p> <p>There were no matters escalated.</p>	
W.4.19.5	<p>Strategic Risks relevant to the Committee</p> <p>SU drew attention to the risks specific to this Committee as highlighted within the document and all agreed to remain sighted on the risks during discussions.</p>	
W.4.19.6	<p>Workforce Report: Updated set of measures and KPIs</p> <p>PC reminded the Committee that it had previously agreed to reduce the number of KPIs linked to the BAF. The paper presented included a proposal for five KPIs linked to the five strategic aims of the People Strategy. PC drew particular attention to the proposed new measures included within Appendix 1 and discussed in detail with the Committee the rationale behind each of the KPI's (as provided in Appendix 2). The discussion focussed on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The ability to benchmark against local Trust's on a range of areas • The equality objectives and the fact that these were shared objectives agreed across the District. • The targets proposed for Staff turnover (10 to 14%) and Appraisal (95%) • The proposed Attendance targets presented in Appendix 1 (4.6%) were subject to a great deal of scrutiny by the Committee. It was important to ensure that the target was achievable however it was recognised that 	

No.	Agenda Item	ACTIONS
	<p>work needed to continue to ensure that sickness levels reduced. The Committee settled on a target of 4.5 and agreed that this would be subject to further review in the next year.</p> <p>SU thanked PC for the report and the Committee for the detailed debate and scrutiny that had taken place. Subject to the change agreed to the target for Attendance, the Committee agreed the updated set of KPI measures.</p>	
W.4.19.7	<p>Model Hospital Data</p> <p>PC advised that she was still awaiting clarification from the 'Model Hospital Group' with regard to the approach to be taken to the Workforce Data. In the meantime, the Education and Workforce sub-committee was building the model hospital data into reports going forwards e.g. agency and bank staff usage. Going forward model hospital data would also be used in relation to sickness rates.</p>	
W.4.19.8	<p>Workforce Committee Dashboard</p> <p>The Committee discussed the dashboard in detail. The following key points were noted.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Appraisal Rates:</u> Completion rates were on a slight downward trend since December 2018. At end March recorded as 90.54%. Measures to address are being taken include targeting areas where appraisals are overdue. Focus is also being placed on making sure that reporting continues as the Trust transitions to the new Clinical Business Units. • <u>Equality Indicators:</u> An update would be provided at the next meeting. • <u>Staff FFT:</u> The Committee was pleased to note the significant improvements in the Q4 position in both measures; staff recommending treatment here at 71% (up from 66% in Q2). With regard to staff recommending the Trust as a place to work; again, the Q4 position of 61%, shows a marked improvement over the Q2 position of 53%. • <u>Sickness:</u> There had been little change in the year to date position which has remained fairly static. • <u>Nursing fill rates:</u> These have also remained relatively stable. • <u>Staff in Post & Use of Agency:</u> PC discussed with the Committee the proposal to replace this indicator with one covering 'agency as a percentage of whole-time equivalent' which would support more meaningful discussion going forward. The Committee agreed. The Committee also noted that turnover remained on a downward trend. • <u>Staff Advocates & Harassment and Bullying:</u> The Committee noted that following the introduction of the new Staff Advocacy Service, in year data was now available with total contacts numbering 67. It was anticipated that the number of contacts would increase. The Committee discussed the number of investigations initiated with regard to harassment and bullying which totalled 29 in Quarter. • <u>New Starter Training:</u> This remained on target. <p>The Committee was pleased to note the good performance against targets particularly with regard to Staff FFT.</p>	
W.4.19.9	<p>Development Session - Leadership Development</p> <p>PC introduced the session and welcomed RS, JH and LH to the meeting.</p> <p>LH provided a comprehensive presentation on the work that had taken place since the previous presentation to Committee in November 2018 with regard</p>	

No.	Agenda Item	ACTIONS
	<p>to leadership development, talent management and succession planning. JH and RS referenced the specific developments and initiatives underway within Nursing and Midwifery and Medical Staffing.</p> <p>LH referenced the range of empirical evidence to support the links between leadership, staff engagement, culture and improving patient outcomes which had also informed the development of the Trust's People Strategy.</p> <p>The Committee noted the commitment of the Trust to develop excellent leaders and managers so that staff would feel empowered, valued, supported and well-led. They discussed with the presenters the following actions taken (and those underway) to achieve the objectives set out in the People Strategy which included;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Implementation of the Leadership and Management development framework • Delivery of Senior Leadership development and high performance coaching • Training of in-house coaches and work undertaken with NHS Leadership Academy • Introduction of an intranet hub for staff highlighting all development opportunities • Increasing access to district wide programmes; such as Engaging Leaders and Moving Forward for BAME staff • Changes implemented to the programme in January 2019, following a review in the Autumn of 2018 <p>The Committee noted the evidence of good feedback from staff which is supporting continuous improvements and also noted the delivery mechanisms for this work which included;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Workshops • Leadership modules • Appraisal workshops <p>The Committee also noted the improvements in the Staff Survey results in relation to Managers which had increased significantly and were above the average. JH discussed with the Committee the benefits the programmes had with regard to the development of Nursing and Midwifery staff citing the success of the leadership development days and other initiatives that nurses have been encouraged to undertake. RS discussed with the Committee how the new Trust Structure includes many doctors who are new to management roles and the supports being put in place to support their development. Committee noted the new Consultant Development programme which had been implemented and which incorporated the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality improvement work • Informal seminar/lecture programme • Leadership development programme <p>The Committee noted the next steps which included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Development of System leaders that work across the healthcare system • Growing and developing staff within the new CBU structures • Exploring more ways that the Trust can use Apprenticeships • Build on foundations already established so the Trust can manage talent and get better at succession planning 	

No.	Agenda Item	ACTIONS
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Being sighted on newly promoted staff and new starters to address their development. <p>SU and all Committee members expressed their thanks to LH, JH and RS for the insightful presentation.</p>	
W.4.19.10	<p>Staff Survey Action Plan</p> <p>PC summarised the paper which provided an overview of the work undertaken in the last year with regard to the priorities then set. In particular the Committee noted the summary on page 4 of the document which reported on Trust performance against eight priorities (7 of which showed significant improvement and one for which there was no change).</p> <p>The Committee noted the high-level staff survey action plan going forward and in particular, the overarching priority related to 'improvement of staff engagement around morale'.</p> <p>With regard to the 'measurement of success'; following discussion it was determined that achievement of the KPIs would support this. The Committee discussed the importance of staff understanding what we measure and why and through what means we are seeking to be in the top 20%.</p> <p>SU thanked PC for her report. The Committee noted the action plan.</p>	
W.4.19.11	<p>People's Strategy Annual Plans</p> <p>PC advised the Committee that the comprehensive report details the plans set over the last year along with what has been achieved. The Committee was asked to note the high level plan for 2019/2020.</p> <p>SU thanked PC for the report noting that the plan would be reviewed once the new National Workforce Plan had been published which would be in October.</p>	
W.4.19.12	<p>Nurse Staffing Data Publication Reports – March 2019</p> <p>KD asked the Committee to note that the staffing metrics reflected similar performance to that of previous months. She also asked the Committee to note that the Model Hospital data now routinely formed part of the reporting. KD drew attention to the position of the Trust in comparison to others and asked the Committee to note that the Trust presented in the 'middle' which was a reasonable position to be in.</p> <p>The Committee discussed and noted the report.</p>	
W.4.19.13	<p>Medical Appraisal and Revalidation Annual Report</p> <p>RS advised the Committee of the requirement for all Doctors with a licence to practice to undertake an annual appraisal. An annual report on medical appraisal and evaluation was required to be submitted to NHS England - as detailed within the paper.</p> <p>The Committee noted the high level of completed appraisals amongst the Trust's doctors which stood at 97% (compared to the 88% average for the sector). Of those doctors not completing their appraisals within the required time; 9 of the 11 doctors presented legitimate reasons. The 2 doctors who presented no good reason are being dealt with in accordance with the GMC</p>	

No.	Agenda Item	ACTIONS
	<p>rule's for non-engagement.</p> <p>The Committee discussed the report with AB and RS. AB asked the committee to note in particular the work undertaken by Jane Robson, Medical Revalidation Manager in supporting the delivery of the work. SU asked for ABs comments to be noted and, along with the full Committee, commended all involved in delivering such good results.</p> <p>SU thanked RS and RS left the meeting.</p>	
W.4.19.14	<p>Board Assurance Framework</p> <p>SU asked if the Committee was satisfied with the risk score and if it felt that it had received sufficient assurance with regard to the items presented and discussed at the meeting. The Committee was satisfied that the risk appetite remained as 'seeking'. With regard to the assurance provided at the meeting the Committee felt confident that it was on track and where it should be at this point in time.</p> <p>A discussion took place regarding Communications and the role it could better play in supporting the celebration of the culture of the organisation. AP stated that it was essential to ensure that every piece of work is aligned back to the Trust's vision and strategic objectives. SU suggested it might be useful to explore the delivery of a Board development session with regard to the communications strategy.</p>	Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs
W.4.19.15	<p>Any Other Business</p> <p>No other business was discussed</p>	
W.4.19.16	<p>Matters to share with other Committees</p> <p>There were no matters to share</p>	
W.4.19.17	<p>Matters to Escalate to the Strategic Risk Register</p> <p>There were no matters to escalate</p>	
W.4.19.18	<p>Matters to Escalate to the Board of Directors</p> <p>There were no matters to escalate</p>	
W.4.19.19	<p>Items for Corporate Communications</p> <p>Committee noted the regular inclusion of items regarding leadership development included within Let's Talk.</p>	
W.4.19.20	<p>Agenda items for the Workforce Committee scheduled 29 May 2018</p> <p>Committee to review the items included on the agenda for the next meeting and agreed that 'medical appraisals' would be removed from the agenda. Committee also confirmed that the meeting would require 2 hours.</p>	
W.4.19.21	<p>Date and time of next meeting</p> <p>29 May 2019 11:00-13:00</p>	



Bradford Teaching Hospitals
NHS Foundation Trust

BRADFORD TEACHING HOSPITALS NHS FOUNDATION TRUST
ACTIONS FROM WORKFORCE COMMITTEE – March 2019

Date of Meeting	Agenda Item	Required Action	Lead	Timescale	Comments/Progress
27.02.19	W.2.19.9	Workforce Report - Workforce Dashboard to reflect any changes in the metrics and measures and align with the BAF from April 2019.	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 29 May 2019	
30.01.19	W.1.19.17	Development Sessions (best practice). To schedule a Committee tour of the Education Department's Simulation Lab in February.	Head of Corporate Governance	Workforce Committee 29 May 2019	Team unavailable to deliver session in February 2019. Date of future attendance to be confirmed with the Chief Medical Officer.
24.04.19	W.4.19.3	Unconfirmed Minutes of the meeting held on 27 March 2019 Amendments required, as detailed within the body of the minutes.	Head of Corporate Governance	Workforce Committee 29 May 2019	Minutes amended. <u>Action concluded.</u>
27.03.19	W.3.19.16	Items for Corporate Communications The good news to be communicated around Appraisals and Personal Development Plans - JP requested a specific communication from the Workforce Committee acknowledging the efforts of staff and recognising the good results in the many different areas of performance - in particular recognising significant efforts in the reduction in use of agency.	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 29 May 2019	
27.03.19	W.3.19.17	Committee Review The following should be noted and form part of the review. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The necessity of having monthly meetings of the Workforce Committee - The disproportionate level of detail contained within papers for monthly meetings – given the 	Head of Corporate Governance	Workforce Committee 29 May 2019	New Chair in post early May. <u>Update to Committee 29 May 2019:</u> Date for all Board Committee Reviews being considered by the Chair and Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs. Committee to

Date of Meeting	Agenda Item	Required Action	Lead	Timescale	Comments/Progress
		<p>level of update provided.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - If meetings remain monthly - should consideration be given to holding one longer meeting, then one shorter meeting the following month? - Committee might also like to consider holding quarterly transactional meetings and then have a 'subject-based' approach for additional monthly meetings. - Committee would benefit from wider membership. It would be beneficial for deputies to attend and present particular items <p>These points would be shared with the Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs and the BTHFT Chair to support the review when it takes place.</p>			note that further update will be provided to Workforce Committee to be provided in June 2019.
30.01.19	W.1.19.12	Guardian of Safe Working Hours. BG agreed to provide a more detailed update to the Committee in the next report with regard to assurance in relation to the time taken to review outstanding exceptions.	Chief Medical Officer	Workforce Committee 29 May 2019	Item included on the agenda. <u>Action concluded.</u>
30.01.19	W.1.19.17	Workforce Committee Annual Work Programme: Development Session – Informatics Strategy five-year plan. An invitation to be extended to the Chief Digital and Information Officer to deliver the session.	Head of Corporate Governance	Workforce Committee 26 June 2019	Date of attendance to be confirmed with the Chief Digital and Information Officer. The session has now been confirmed as 26 June due to the unavailability of CF for 29 May. <u>Action concluded</u>
30.01.19	W.1.19.7	Workforce Committee Annual Work Programme: Guardian of Safe Working Hours. Andy Brennan, Associate Postgraduate Dean, to be invited to deliver a Board of Directors Development Session on 'Guardian of Safe Working Hours' at a time to be agreed during the next 6 months.	Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs	Workforce Committee 26 June 2019.	To be presented to the Board of Directors at meeting scheduled for 7 March 2019. Added to the June Board Development Session schedule. Action to be reviewed to confirm

Date of Meeting	Agenda Item	Required Action	Lead	Timescale	Comments/Progress
					completion on 26 June 2019.
30.01.19	W.1.19.11	Nurse Staffing Data Publication Report November 2018 and December 2018. KD advised she is working with BG on a new report to cover maternity services and metrics. An update on progress would be provided at a future meeting.	Chief Nurse	Workforce Committee 26 June 2019	
24.04.19	W.4.19.14	BAF: Proposed Board Development Session A discussion took place regarding Communications and the role it could better play in supporting the celebration of the culture of the organisation. AP stated that it was essential to ensure that every piece of work is aligned back to the Trust's vision and strategic objectives. SU suggested it might be useful to explore the delivery of a Board development session with regard to the communications strategy.	Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs	Board of Directors 11 July 2019	
30.01.19	W.1.19.13	Update on Seven Day Service Performance against Clinical Standards for 2018 BG stated that following the completion of the audit a report will be provided to the Committee.	Chief Medical Officer	Workforce Committee 24 July 2019	
30.01.19	W.1.19.7	Workforce Committee Annual Work Programme: Development Sessions BG agreed to bring a presentation on next year's process to the Workforce Committee meeting in September 2019.	Chief Medical Officer	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	